



SOCIALLY INCLUSIVE CITIES' PROJECT
REPORT OF THE FIRST NATIONAL WORKSHOP
COUNTRY REPORT
By

Joyce Ogho OGWEZI
Delta State University, Abraka
Delta State, NIGERIA
&
Benjamin S. C. UZOCHUKWU
University of Nigeria
Enugu Campus
Enugu, NIGERIA



Date: Tuesday, 23rd May, 2017
Time: 10am-3pm
Venue: Board Room, Faculty of the Social Sciences
Delta State University, Abraka
Delta State
Nigeria

TABLE OF CONTENTS

About The Workshop	3
Method-----	4
Background: Some perspectives on the Nigerian Context-----	4
The Question of Ethnicity in Nigeria-----	5
Nigeria Constitution and Ethnic Minority Issues-----	5
Workshop: Formal Opening and Organisation-----	7
Ethnic and religious minorities that experience inequalities and drivers of exclusion.....	8
Other groups facing exclusion in Nigeria.....	10
The impact of social exclusion on the citizens.....	10
Research designs/methods that might help to improve social justice and their challenges.....	10
Key challenges for present and future research.....	11
Overcoming the challenges.....	12
Overlaps between health, education, local government and police.....	12
Strategies to increase access for the socially excluded.....	12
Collaborations for social inclusion.....	12
World Café Reports-----	14
Key References.....	18
Appendix 1: Workshop Programme.....	21
Appendix 2: List of Workshop Participants.....	23
Appendix 3: Databases Searched.....	25

About the workshop

This workshop is one of four, over the next 18 months, that will be held in Nigeria in parallel with partner countries (UK, India, Vietnam and Kenya). Participants, who were drawn from government, security, academia, and women groups, considered evidence on the Nigerian situation and ways that the public institutions of local government, health, education and police services have tried to reduce social exclusion.

The overarching goal of this first National workshop was to provide a platform for participants to discuss the evidence available, identify possible gaps in knowledge and common issues across public services, as well as suggest ways in which further research might help support more socially inclusive cities. This became imperative because failure to include all social groups in development globally has led to people from minority ethnic and religious groups being more likely to have low paid work, risky living conditions and poorer access to healthcare, education, finance and public transport. This is because public services can be a major influence on how well ethnic and religious minorities are able to participate in society and be treated as full citizens.

The specific objectives were to:

- Present evidence on key drivers and issues
- Use creative engagement techniques to support facilitated discussions about evidence gaps and how future research could help inform policy and practice needed to improve the social inclusion of people from minority ethnic and religious groups
- Identify priority research areas and methods to address population facing greatest levels of disadvantage and gaps in evidence

This report incorporates evidence from literature review by co-investigators, feedback from relevant stakeholders from both public and private institutions and workshop participants.



A total of 30 participants working in diverse areas, such as health, education, civil service, law and community empowerment participated in the workshop. Appendices 1 & 2 provide the workshop programme and a list of workshop participants.

Method

We reviewed papers exploring strategies to reduce social exclusion in public services for minority ethnic and religious groups. The review was designed to provide answers to thirteen pre-determined research questions covering areas of social exclusion, strategies for inclusion and suggestion for future research, each of which was structured around four thematic focal areas.

A total of 257 papers were screened (85 from a global search) and 172 from a Nigeria-specific search), out of which 24 (global List) and 13 (Nigeria List) [GM1] were considered eligible for review, which was conducted from January to April, 2017. The review covered literature searched from 5 academic databases (See Appendix 3) covering publications in Healthcare, Social Sciences, Economics, Education, Gender and Child Rights. The following steps were adopted to facilitate the review:

- Systematic searching of databases using relevant country-specific keywords
- Screening of 85 abstracts, of which 58 were considered eligible
- Selection guided by access to the full text of screened publications (Total: 24 from UK list and 13 from Nigeria List)
- Summarising of each of the relevant article using a standardised template.
- Analysis of each of the completed summaries guided by the 13 research questions.

BACKGROUND

Some perspectives on the Nigerian Context

Nigeria is an essentially multi-cultural society with an estimated 250 ethnic groups. This commonly-quoted figure differs from those of experts [GM2] like Bangura (nd), who put the number at 470. The renowned Sociologist, Otite (1990) provides a tentative list of 374, while acknowledging Hoffman's (1974) earlier estimate of 394 ethnic groups and Wente-Lukas' entry of 550 to 619 groups. Mustapha (2000), on the other hand, argues that Otite's list had excluded some ethnic minorities. All of these underscore the difficulty inherent in putting a realistic estimate to ethnic grouping in Nigeria.

A number of factors have been identified as responsible for this difficulty. These include problems of classification, the issues surrounding shared language or related dialects, common cultural traits or religious beliefs, common origin or ancestry, and so on. This explains why Hoffman (1974) used linguistic criteria (which is further complicated by multi-lingualism and the politically-motivated 'dialect question' [GM3]). Agheyisi (1984) also argues that there are 'about 400' language groups in Nigeria; and suggests that, with the exclusion of the 9 'majority' groups, 390 languages are spoken by one-fifth on the population, with over 300 'minor' languages spoken by only 7 percent of the population. Rather than use language, Otite (2000) refers to such notions of common descent and a shared socio-ecological space.

In addition, some constantly changing economic and political factors have continued to further shape ethnic boundaries and trigger group affiliation and assimilation. Consequently, some group identities may sometimes be subsumed under broader categories to the extent of obscuring their real self-identification

(Mustapha, 2010). Jega (2003) expresses a similar view, when he notes that ‘identity politics is the mutually reinforcing interplay between identities and the pursuit of material benefits within the area of competitive politics’. This seems to suggest identities are easily manipulated in political competition for the capturing and inequitable distribution of ‘scarce resources and procurement of positions, appointments, and winning of elections’

Miller (2003) recognises this unintended imposition and argues that ‘democracy ought to be willing to include certain basic rights in the Constitution, precisely, to protect minorities against unfriendly nature of the majorities’. The Nigeria Constitution recognises this and stipulates in Chapter IV, Sections 33-44 a variety of fundamental rights of the people. Of particular reference is Section 15, which prohibits discrimination on the basis of ethnic origin, sex (gender), religion, or linguistic affiliation. The real problem, therefore, is not necessarily the absence of constitutional provisions, but rather the imposition of certain existential conditions that frustrate the implementation of such provisions. One of these conditions relates to the enormous influence that those in power at the three levels of governance and the political party in power may wield at any given time. As Toyo (1999) notes ‘a political party of tribalists, power sharers, sycophants, greedy opportunists and get-rich-quick gangsters can never translate intentions of the Constitution into practice’

The question of Ethnicity in Nigeria

Earlier studies focused on parts of the socio-political entities referred to as ‘tribes’ (Evans-Pitchard, 1940; Green, 1964; Hoblen, 1971). However, with the dismantling of all political structures and declaration of independence by African states in the 1950s and 1960s, ‘larger socio-cultural and identifiable socio-linguistic aggregates’ emerged (Oтите: 2000). These groups share common cultural symbols of language, value system, behavioural patterns, and occupy particular spatial location.

It is important to note that ethnic groups in Nigeria are not necessarily the creations of colonialism, since they existed before the arrival of colonial masters. However, by providing a peaceful environment for all groups to co-exist, they enabled the groups to re-organise their cultural heritage. Despite this, Post and Vickers (1973: 41) argued that through their system of indirect rule and by incorporating traditional political institutions into administrative structure of local governance, the intra-ethnic solidarity of the groups were further weakened.

Nigeria Constitution and Ethnic Minority Issues

Nigeria’s first constitution was enacted by the colonial masters in 1960, with Queen Elizabeth II as titular head of state. As an independent state, Nigeria’s second constitution came in force at her third anniversary in 1963. This continued in operation until the 1966-Military coup, which overthrew Nigeria’s democratic institutions. By 1979, when the Second Republic came into existence, another constitution, which vacated the Westminster system of the First Republic in favour of a presidential system was deployed. Then, there was the 1993 constitution with the establishment of a Third Republic that was never fully implemented until another military coup brought the military back in power in 1983-1999. The 1999 Constitution, which

restored Nigeria's democratic rule, remains in force till date with only two recent amendments approved by former President Goodluck Jonathan in January, 2011.

The Constitution of Nigeria provides the basic norms from which all other laws - including those enacted by the various Federal and State Houses of Assembly - derive their validity. It forbids any form of discrimination against 'a particular community, tribe, place of origin, religion or political opinion' (Bach, 1997); but this generalised constitutional principle of non-discrimination does not make reference to 'ethnic minorities', even though the Henry Willink Commission of 1957 affirmed that the minority fears were not unfounded. In its report submitted in April 1958, the Commission proposed the balancing of power within Nigeria in order to minimise power-dominance by the majority groups (Ojiako, 1981). Although state creation was considered as a good solution to this problem, yet the report downplayed it on the ground that it will lead to more agitations and creation of more minorities. Consequently, apart from the minority-populated Mid-West Region that was created from the Yoruba West in 1964, the political aspirations of the other minorities were largely ignored until the collapse of the First Republic in January 1966 (Ojiako, 1981).



The agitation for and determination to create more states 'to allay minority fears' gathered momentum from 1967, after the creation of the Midwest Region. Before then (i.e. 1960-1963), there were only three regions, namely Northern Region, Western Region and Eastern Region. In the years following these (i.e. 1963-67, the number of regions increased to 4 with the 'carving' of the Mid-Western Region from the Western Region. In subsequent years, the number of states increased from 4 regions to 12, after the crises that resulted in the Nigerian Civil War (in 1967-1970). Later the number increased further to 19 (1976), 21 (1987), 30 (1991); and finally to 36 (1996) with Abuja, as the Federal

capital Territory (FCT). These 36 states are also informally structured into 6 geo-political zones, which reflect, to a large extent, some deliberate ethno-regional groupings.

As the number of states multiplied, the local government areas (LGAs) also grew from 301 (1976) to 775 (in 1996) (Osaghae: 1991). These increases strengthened some minorities' control within their states and local government areas as they emerged as new 'majority' within their former minority groups. For example in Benue State, Tiv, a major ethnic group, which is a smaller group in the Nigerian context, emerged as a major player over the smaller groups (including Idoma, Igede, and Jukuns). For others, these 'unnegotiated alliances' also triggered fierce intra-minority distrusts and disintegration of the generic 'minority' identities that had been formed. This was further compounded by the over-centralisation of power and control of oil revenues at the Federal level for over 5 decades.

WORKSHOP: FORMAL OPENING & ORGANISATION

The workshop was officially declared open, after a brief prayer, by Professor Chris Eghwudjakpor, Dean, Faculty of the Social Sciences, Delta State University, Abraka, who was represented by Professor .Atare Otite.



Thereafter, participants introduced themselves, while stating three key words/phrases, which summarise their interest in the topic This was followed by an overview of the project and how it was conceived.

The findings of the literature review on social exclusion and inclusive studies, which were carried out in Nigeria were shared. This was followed by a participator group work using the World Café format to promote exchange among participants and build on participants' knowledge and experiences in this area.

Onigu Otite (a renowned Sociologist) provided a vital backdrop against which to situate this very important project. He insists that 'there are hardly any societies in the world in which we have full equality of access to all relevant life chances and opportunities', since most countries and cities are essentially



One of the workshop participants, Professor Emeritus pluralistic in nature, and are 'composed of several ethnic and religious groups and other social categories'. There are many ethnic minorities, especially in the northern parts of Nigeria, most of whom have been 'Hausanised' (Otite, 2017). Religious pluralism, on the other hand, involves Moslem/Islam, Christian (both orthodox and several protestant sects) and indigenous religious organisations and practices (Otite, 2017) Some socially excluded groups identified are vulnerable groups (women and girls), Nigerians living with disabilities, and with the creation of 'first, second, and third-class towns/townships', migrant

works/job seekers and city squatters from various ethnic groups. On the concept of social inclusiveness, Otite (2017) expressed delight in this project that targets certain categories of people in our societies--including ethnic and religious minorities, women and girls, people living with disabilities, etc---who are subjected to discrimination and deprivation in matters of access to opportunities relevant for improving their lives. In his final submission, he suggested a re-conceptualisation of the Socially Inclusive Cities project (which, in his view, is very futuristic) to a more sociologically appropriate and relevant consideration of Socially Inclusive SOCIETIES ---which provides the basis for focusing on either Nigeria as a whole or confining ourselves to particular geo-political regions/areas.

The workshop proceedings are summarised in the following sections of the report, and structured around these major research questions that reflect the workshop objectives:

- 1) Which ethnic and religious minorities experience inequalities and what impact does this have upon them?
- 2) What are the key drivers of ethnic and religious exclusion and what concepts and theories are used to explain such exclusion?
- 3) What research designs might help to improve social justice?
- 4) What mechanisms/models of collaboration can be identified that support partnerships between different stakeholders?
- 5) Which experts, other networks and large research projects are currently developing relevant knowledge in this area and could collaborate?

PART 1: SOCIAL EXCLUSION

Which ethnic and religious minorities experience inequalities?

This section identifies minority groups that need to be prioritised for inclusion in public services. The literature review, in line with the scope of the international collaborative project that it was part of, focused on identifying religious and ethnic minorities. From a total of 257 papers screened, 37 were reviewed and the findings were documented. The deliberations that followed at the workshop expanded this scope and identified several other groups in Nigeria, often having overlapping religious and/or ethnic identities that face social exclusion.

For the literature review, *social inclusion* was defined as 'access to, quality of service and representation of religious or ethnic minorities in public services that are comparable to the majority ethnic or religious group'. The focus was on health, education, religion and government institutions.

Out of the 37 studies reviewed, 6 showed ethnicity as the main cause of social exclusion due to social norms associated with ethnic groups, life style and disease prevalence in some ethnic groups (Alesina, A et al, 2016; Brieger, W.R. et al, 1997; Nwanaju, 2016; Odimegwu, C. & O.D. Somefun, 2017; Udoh, 1994; Ugo, 2011). The ethnic groups identified were the Fulani's, Ibibio men and Ijaws. Religion was found to be the main cause of exclusion in 7 out of 37 studies reviewed due to new style of education in some religions; some policies by some religious groups in some states; poverty; Inferred roles placed on some groups of people by their religion; lack of acceptance of health care as seen in the case of polio immunization and language barrier (Al-Mujtab, M et al, 2016; Abdul-Hakeem, 2015; Gregory, 2014; Hoechner, 2011; Jibril, 2009; Olusanya, B. et al, 2010; Saratu, 2006). Some of the religions identified were the muslims and small protestant groups.

Socio-cultural issues were seen as the main causes of exclusion in 6 out of 37 studies (Agoro, 2014; Aja, G. N. et al, 2011; Ayanore, M. A. et al, 2016; Anonymous, 1995; Oluyemi, J. a. et al, 2014; Tajudeen,

2015). Examples of which include female genital cutting still on despite its awareness and dangers; girl-child marriage; polygamy; widow inheritance in different ethnic groups; males allowed to have multiple sexual partners; increased domestic violence against females; deprivation of access to health care and education. These cultures are prominent in some rural Ibo communities, Northern Nigeria and some communities in the Middle Belt. Some females face exclusion just for the fact that they are females. This was seen in 14 out of 37 studies (Al-Mujtaba, M. et al, 2016; Saratu, Ajah, I. O. et al, 2014; Anonymous, 1992; Babalola, S. et al, 2006; Babalola, S. & A. Fatusi, 2009; Barros, A. et al, 2012; Dangoji, 1995; Itimi, K et al, 2014; Lewin, S. et al, 2010; Ogbogu, 2009, 2011; Oringanje, C. et al, 2016; Unterhalter, 2012; Salaudeen, A. G. et al, 2010). The reason for this exclusion was attributed to lack of empowerment; their unmet needs for reproductive health due to socio-economic dependence on men; cultural traditions that endanger their lives; gender inequality in education; poverty; use of unskilled health service providers; societal expectations on the role of women.

During the deliberations at the workshop, social exclusion was explained as the situation where *certain people and groups are deprived access to certain opportunities and life chances due to the religious or*



ethnic groups they come from. Exclusion is at work, when you deny people of opportunities for their own development in the areas of education, access to political power, basic amenities, career growth (especially in appointments and promotion), and access to information.

Participants identified that there was rarely any country with equal rights and access for all citizens. They also said that some of the groups facing social exclusion have been able to raise strong voices and garner support from other stakeholders in the society to bring into public discourse the need for enhancing their inclusion, for example, the persons living with disabilities. While other groups have been seen to identify with the majority groups closest to them - for the sake of employment and recognition - others dress and speak like the majority groups to curry favour from the public. This is commonly found in the minority ethnic groups in the North. The reason for this is the cultural symbol of the ruler of the

country, which, in this case, is a Moslem and comes from the North. This same reason also affects the appointments into public positions in the country, and all these started after the amalgamation in 1914, which led to the development of 389 ethnic groups. Most of them are not able to exist alone but must depend on one another for survival and recognition. The quota system practised in the country helps promote and, to a certain extent, ‘empowers’ the minority groups and gives them the opportunity to transform their minority status into a more relevant one, as is the case with the ‘minority Ijaw groups’ in the riverine areas of the country.

In summary, key drivers of exclusion were identified to include culture; religion; ethnicity; inequalities in access to education, resources, opportunities, infrastructure; sectionalism; power imbalances, misconceptions and greed.

Other groups facing exclusion in Nigeria

Another group identified by the participants perceived to be facing one form of exclusion or the other is the women, who have very limited representation in political affairs, both at the local/community and national levels, as well as in law, business and other public arenas. This is, in spite of the fact that, they make up about 50-51% of Nigerian population. Persons living with disability are also hardly given responsibilities, even though some of them are highly educated and competent. The peculiar situation of this group is hardly considered, when decisions on architectural designs on public buildings and general infrastructure are taken and implemented. This makes it very difficult for them to move about easily. So many instances were given to drive home these facts.

The impact of social exclusion on the citizens

From the deliberations, the participants identified some of the outcomes of social exclusion and social inequalities to include poor indices in national activities like reduced number of people gaining education and increasing illiteracy, lack of employment, deteriorating health care services which led to increased maternal and child death, increase in number of people involved with prostitution, armed robbery, oil bunkers, communal clashes and avengers such as the current *Boko-Haram*, a major religious crisis in the country and the Niger-Delta avengers. These have led to loss of human lives and the destruction of properties worth millions of naira. All these lead to further impoverishment of those who are already poor and deplete the poor resources available in those places. Religion is liberal but some groups of people want to be more religious than others and infringe on the human rights of others. For example, they try to prevent those around them from wearing trousers and leaving their heads uncovered, thus leading to clashes and killings; and leaving many citizens to live in fear, while creating mistrust between the citizens and the policy makers.

Research designs/methods that might help to improve social justice and their challenges

This section looks at the designs or methods that can be used to conduct studies on social inclusion or exclusion. The participants first identified the problems that the study hoped to address and these included injustice, inequity, unfair play and deprivation of jobs and access to social services. The following were identified as key variables in possible research questions in studies on exclusion: Ethnicity; Religion; Culture/Cultural values; Value system; Widows' rights; Children's rights; and Rights of the persons living with disabilities. The following were identified as populations for studies on exclusion: Women; Children; physically-challenged; Rural dwellers; Ethnic minorities; and Vulnerable groups in the society.

Then they decided that mixed methods approach and triangulation was the best way to help come out with a better result, despite the method used. Be it the cross sectional method, experimental method or the cohort method. There is need to first carry out a participant and non-participant observation, as this would help give the researcher an insight into the culture and social norms of the people and then look at the political composition of their council and leaders.

Survey can be done to address this issue, by use of questionnaire and then interviews can be done in the form of key in-depth interview or focused group discussion by way of purposive selection of the participants who have a large wealth of knowledge and ideas in this area. The all stake holders model will be used as the theoretical framework for the study. Deliberative dialogue can be used to unmask a lot of issues in the context, while content analysis can be done on reviews that were done in the past. Behaviour over the years can be looked at, then the result will be used to triangulate with the current findings and then used as an evidence-based mechanism to help inform policy and practice.

Key challenges for present and future research

The key challenges for present and future research were identified by participants to include:

- Lack of finances: To carry out research is very expensive, but most organizations and people do not put in time to research due to poor remuneration and finances to help them carry out good research. The problem is that most of the companies here do not sponsor research especially in the area of social inclusiveness.
- Lack of interest: Most people in the communities do not have interest in communicating with the researcher, when they think nothing good will come out of it.
- Ethnic bias: This occurs when someone from a different locality comes to carry out such sensitive researches and people are not willing to cooperate with them due to ethnic bias.
- Lack of sufficient training: This occurs when the researchers are not adequately trained to carry out the research.
- Lack of research attitude: Most of our researches are carried out on impulse and no one does any previous planning before the research is started. Also research gaps are not identified from previous researches before new projects are carried out, that way we have a lot of repeated studies in various locations.
- Our environment is not research friendly and not conducive for research

Overcoming the challenges:

The challenges above can be overcome by carrying out proper advocacy before a research is embarked on in a community. It is also important to apply for international grants before a big research is embarked on and to approach the big local and national organisations for necessary support and corporate ‘buy into’ the programme. Ethnic bias can be overcome by involving the indigenes in any research that is to be carried out in their community. Research gaps related to the area should be identified before a new research is carried out. This means that a proper review of both grey and published literature should be carried out before any new research is embarked on. This will help identify the existing gaps and also prevent duplication of research efforts and findings.

Overlaps between health, education, local government and security sectors:

Most of these sectors have a lot of things in common, like poor infrastructure which exists amongst the various sectors. Their buildings are all dilapidated and not maintained. Poor welfare packages exist amongst all the sectors; for example, their houses/quarters, etc. Poor remuneration across the four sectors and lack of promotion are still critical concerns, despite the delicate nature of their jobs. This creates discontent, generates demotivation and disinterest in what they do, and in some extreme cases, results in strike actions, demonstrations and work-to-rule actions that often paralyse the economy.

Other identified overlaps include access to services, appointments/recruitments, promotions, education which are dependent on factors like language, ethnicity, religion, financial status, connection, gender, political power and affiliation, among others.

Strategies to increase access for the socially excluded

Some strategies used to increase access for the socially excluded as extracted from the literature review include community engagement through advocacy, rapport building needed to engender early ‘buy in’ and acceptability of the planned activities, increased awareness creation among community people and capacity building. Other strategies include increasing access to needed support including finance, specific services like communication, health care as well as enacting /implementing policies. Others include restructuring the service team and building/sustaining collaborations with communities in order to improve access and strengthen institutional capacity.

Collaborations for social inclusion

There is potential/prospect for collaboration to ensure reduction of exclusion from public services. Areas of such collaborations include ethnicity, culture, language, position, religion, class and gender among others. These barriers can be broken down via shared common space, for example, use of common facilities, transport system, organising/ attending parties, social gatherings, awareness and empowerment programmes deployed through seminars, workshops, religious organisations, ceremonies—like marriages and national events. These strategies, in addition to sports and entertainment (films, acting, music)

programmes, among others, provide ample opportunities for putting these issues on the front burner and for sustaining the conversation and discourse. However, the contents of the awareness programmes, seminars and such programmes should be carefully selected so as not to end up creating more exclusion or advancing someone's exclusive agenda.

Key stakeholders were identified to be the religious leaders, traditional leaders, political leaders, heads of political institutions, and organisations, parents and media, among others.

Existing collaborative initiatives include National Youth Service Corps (NYSC), Federal Character Commission and Inter-faith collaboration agency, among others. These are platforms already on ground and running to help bring about social inclusion.

Good practices to be learnt from these identified existing initiatives include tolerance, accommodation of people, appreciation of other cultures, fostering of peace, understanding of individual differences, inter-religious and inter-ethnic marriages, teaching and learning of skills/ skill acquisition, among others.



FIRST NATIONAL WORKSHOP FACILITATORS

Excerpts from World Café Reports:

Group One: Concepts



a) How Does Exclusion Work?

Exclusion is at work when you deny people of opportunities for their own development in the areas of education, access to political power, basic amenities, career growth (especially in appointments and promotion), and access to information.

b) Key Drivers Of Exclusion

Key drivers of exclusion were identified to include Culture; religion; ethnicity; inequalities in access to education, resources, opportunities and infrastructure; as well as sectionalism; and greed.

c) Research Questions To Guide Research On Exclusion

The following were identified as key variables in possible research questions in studies on exclusion: Ethnicity; Religion; Culture/Cultural values; Value system; Widows' rights; Children's rights; and Rights of physically challenged.

d) Population For Studies On Exclusion

The following were identified as populations of studies on exclusion: Women; Children; Physically-challenged; Rural dwellers; Ethnic minorities; and Vulnerable groups in the society.

e) Overlaps

The following areas of overlaps were identified:

- 1 Government policies and implementation
- 2 Community policing and community/local government control of vigilantes
- 3 Funding in education and health by federal, state and local governments as provided for in the constitution in Nigeria
- 4 Staff motivation in implementation of government policies in federal, state and local governments

f) Differences

Differences were spotted in the area of budgetary allocations for the different sectors and levels of government in Nigeria

Group Two: Methods

1. What are the most appropriate methods for research that aim to help reduce inequality?



We first identified the problems that we hoped to address and they include injustice, inequity, unfair play and deprivation of jobs and access to social services.

Answer: Mixed methods and triangulation will be used to help come out with a better result.

Be it the cross sectional method or experimental method or the cohort method. We first need to carry out a participant and non-participant observation this will help give the researcher an insight into the culture and social norms of the people and then look

at the political composition of their council and leaders.

Survey can be done to address this issue, by use of questionnaire and then interviews can be done in the form of KII or FGDs by way of purposive selection of the participants who have a large wealth of knowledge and ideas. The all stake holders model will be used as the theoretical framework.

Deliberative dialogue can be used to unmask a lot of issues in a context.

Also content analysis can be done by review that was done in the past or to look at the behaviour over the years, then the result can be used to triangulate with the current findings and then used as evidence based mechanisms to help inform policy and practice.

2. What are the key challenges for present and future research?

Answer: The key challenges for present and future research are:

- a) Lack of finances: To carry out research is very expensive, but most organizations and people do not put in time to research due to poor remuneration and finances to help them carry out good research. The problem is that most of the companies here do not sponsor research especially in the area of social inclusiveness.
- b) Lack of interest: Most people in the communities do not have interest in communicating with the researchers when they think nothing good will come out of it.
- c) Ethnic bias: This occurs when one from a different locality comes to carry out such sensitive researches and people are not willing to cooperate with them due to ethnic bias.
- d) Lack of sufficient training: This occurs when the trainers are not adequately trained to carry out the research.
- e) Lack of research attitude: Most of our researches are carried out on impulse and no one does any previous planning before the research is started. Also research gaps are not identified from previous researches before new projects are carried out, that way we have a lot of repeated studies in various locations.
- f) Our environment is not research friendly and not conducive for research.

2b) The challenges above can be overcome by:

- a) Proper advocacy before a research is embarked on in a community.
- b) Applying for international grants before a big research is embarked on and also proper approach to the big organizations in town for support.
- c) Ethnic bias can be overcome by involving the indigenes in any research that is to be carried out in their community.
- d) Research gaps related to the area should be identified before a research is carried out. This means that a proper literature review of both grey and published literature should be carried out before any work is embarked on to help identify the existing gaps and also prevent duplication of findings.

3) Overlaps that exist between health, education, local government and police are:

- a) Poor infrastructure exists amongst the various sectors. Their buildings are all dilapidated and not maintained.
- b) Poor welfare packages exist amongst all the sectors; eg their houses/quarters, etc.
- c) Poor remuneration across the four sectors despite the delicate nature of their jobs and lack of promotion when due. This makes many of them disinterested in what they do and it reflects in their activities. Some even embark on strikes and demonstrations while others have not been paid for a long time, like 1 year for some local government workers.

3ii) Differences that exist between health, education, local government and police are:

- a) Educational background of those in the sectors being different. While the teachers and doctors are well educated, the police and local government workers are not as well.

Group Three: Strategies

1 What is the potential for multi-sector collaboration to reduce exclusion from public services? Who are the key stakeholders?



a. There is a potential/prospect for collaboration to ensure reduction of exclusion. Areas of such collaboration include ethnicity, culture, language, position, religion, class and gender, among others.

b. These barriers can be broken down via shared common space, for example, common facilities, transport system, parties, social gatherings, awareness and empowerment programmes, seminars, workshops, religious organizations, marriage, national events (wherein discussions can hold on national issues), sports and entertainment (films, acting, music), among others. However, the contents of the awareness programmes, seminars

and such should be careful not to end up creating more exclusion or advancing someone's personal agenda.

c. Key stakeholders include the religious leaders, traditional leaders, political leaders, heads of political institutions, heads of organizations, parents and media, among others.

2 What good practices can we learn from existing collaborative initiatives?

- a. Existing collaborative initiatives include NYSC, federal character commission and Inter-faith collaboration agency, among others.
- b. Good practices to be learnt include tolerance, accommodation of people, appreciation of other cultures, fostering of peace, understanding of individual differences, inter-religious and inter-ethnic marriages, teaching and learning of skills/ skill acquisition, among others.

3 What overlaps and differences exist between health, education, local government and security sectors?

- a. Overlaps include access to services, appointments/recruitments, promotions, education which are dependent on factors like language, ethnicity, religion, financial status, connection, gender, political power and affiliation, among others.
- b. The differences are the opposite of the overlaps.

Key References

Abdul-Hakeem (2015). Ajijola. Ideas on a North East Nigeria Internally Displaced Persons Rehabilitation. <https://www.linkedin.com/in/aha01>

- Agheyisi, R. N. 1984. Minor Languages in the Nigerian Context: Prospects and Problems' Word, 35. 235-236
- Agoro, IO. 2014. Predictors of Cultural Competence Among Health Care Professionals in a Lagos State Government Facility. UMI Dissertation Publishing.
- Aja, GN; Umahi, EN; and Allen-Alebiosu, OI. 2011. Developing Culturally-oriented Strategies for Communicating Women's Health Issues: A Church-based Intervention. *Education for Health*, Volume 24, Issue 1, 2011.2014 Jul-Sep; 3(3): 193–198.
- Ajah, L.O.; Iyoke, C.A.; Nkwo, P.O.; Nwakoby, B; and Ezeonu, P. 2014. Comparison of domestic violence against women in urban versus rural areas of southeast Nigeria. *International Journal of Women's Health*. 8 October 2014.
- Alesina, A., Michalopoulos, S., & Papaioannou, E (2016). Ethnic Inequality. *Journal of Political Economy*, 124(2), 428–488. <https://doi.org/101086/685300>
- Al-Mujtaba, M.; Cornelius, L.J.; Galadanci, H.; Ereka, S.; Okundaye, J.N.; Adeyemi, O.A.; and Sam-Agudu, N.A. 2016. Evaluating Religious Influences on the Utilization of Maternal Health Services among Muslim and Christian Women in North-Central Nigeria. Hindawi Publishing Corporation BioMed Research International Volume 2016,
- Anonymous. 1992. Barriers to treatment of obstetric emergencies in rural communities of West Africa. The Prevention of Maternal Mortality Network. *Studies in Family Planning* Vol. 23, Issue: 5 Pgs: 279-91.
- 1995. Nigeria training of trainers of TBAs. Newsletter: Inter-African Committee on Traditional Practices Affecting the Health of Women and Children. Issue: 17 Pgs: 11 1995 Apr; (17):11.
- Ayanore, M.A; Pavlova, M; and Groot, W. 2016. Unmet reproductive health needs among women in some West African countries: a systematic review of outcome measures and determinants. *Reproductive Health* (2016) 13:5.
- Babalola, S.; Brasington, A.; Agbasimalo, A; Helland, A.; Nwanguma, E.; and Onah, E. 2006. Impact of a communication programme on female genital cutting in eastern Nigeria. *Tropical Medicine and International Health* Volume 11 No 10 pp 1594–1603 October 2006.
- Babalola, S and Fatusi, A. 2009. Determinants of use of maternal health services in Nigeria – looking beyond individual and household factors. *BMC Pregnancy and Childbirth* 2009, 9:43
- Bach, D. (1997) 'Indigeneity, Ethnicity, and Federalism' in L. Diamond, A. Kirk-Greene & O. Oyediran, eds, *Transition Without End: Nigerian Politics and Civil Society Under Babangida*, Lynne Rienner, Boulder. 338
- Bangura, Yusuf; 'Ethnic Structure and Governance of the Public Sector: African and other Experiences', *Issues Paper*, UNRISD, Geneva
- Barros, AJB; Ronsmans, C; Axelson, H; Loaiza, E; Bertoldi, AD; França, GVA; Bryc, J; Boerma, JT; and Victora, CG. 2012. Equity in maternal, newborn, and child health interventions in Countdown to 2015: a retrospective review of survey data from 54 countries.
- Brieger, W.R.; Oke, G.A.; Otusanya, S.; Adesope, A.; Tijanu, J.; and Banjoko, M. 1997. Ethnic diversity and disease surveillance: Guinea worm among the Fulani in a predominantly Yoruba district of Nigeria. *Tropical Medicine and International Health* Volume 2 No. 1 pp 99–103 January 1997.
- Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria, 1999, Federal Press, Lagos
- Dangoji, J.P (1995) When new meets old: collaborating on safer birthing methods in Nigeria

- Dev. Communication Rep (77):11.
- Evans-Pitchard, E. E. (1940) *The Neur*. Oxford, At the Clarendon Press
- Green, M. M. (1964) *Igbo Village Affairs* London: Frank Cass & Co.
- Gregory, A. M. 2014. Negotiating Muslim Womanhood: The Adaptation Strategies of International Students at Two American Public Colleges. *Graduate Theses and Dissertations*.
- Hoblen, C. W. (1971) *Ethnology of A-Kamba and Other East African Tribes* London: Frank Cass & Co. Ltd
- Hoechner, H. 2011. Striving for Knowledge and Dignity: How Qur'anic Students in Kano, Nigeria, Learn to Live with Rejection and Educational Disadvantage. *European Journal of Development Research* (2011) 23, 712–728
- Hoffman Carl (1974), 'The Languages of Nigeria by Languages Families' Mimeograph Department of Linguistics and Nigerian Languages, University of Ibadan Itimi, K.; Dienne, P.O. and Gbeneol, P.K. 2014. Intimate Partner Violence and Associated Coping Strategies among Women in a Primary Care Clinic in Port Harcourt, Nigeria. . *Journal of Family Medicine and Primary Care*.
- Jega, A. (2003) Identity Transformation and Identity Politics under Structural Adjustment in Nigeria, Kano. Afrikainstitute /Apsalla/CRD Jimida, S. I. (2012): *Beyond Traditions and Primordialism: Tackling the Challenges of Multi-Culturalism in Africa*, Lapai: *Journal of Central Nigeria History* Vol. 6 (2): 34-36
- Jibril, B.T.2009. Determinants of the Predisposition towards the Almajiri Educational System in Kano State, *Nigerian Journal of Economic and Social Studies*.51; 1, 59-73
- Lewin, S.; Munabi-Babigumira, S.; Glenton, C.; Daniels, K.; Bosch-Capblanch, X.; van Wyk, B.E.; Odgaard-Jensen, J.; Johansen, M.; Aja, G.N.; Zwarenstein, M.; Scheel, I.B. 2010. Lay health workers in primary and community health care for maternal and child health and the management of infectious diseases: Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews Issue: 3
- Miller, D. (2003) *Political Philosophy: A Very Short Introduction*. Oxford: Oxford University Press
- Mustapha, Abdul Raufu (2000) 'Transformation of Minority Identities in Post-Colonial Nigeria' in A. Jega, ed., *Identity Transformation and Identity Politics under Structural Adjustment in Nigeria*, Nordiska Afrikainstitutet, Uppala
- (2010) 'Ethnic Minority Groups in Nigeria-Current Situation and Major Problems' Paper presented at the Ninth Session of Commission on Human Rights, Sub-Commission on Promotion and Protection of Human Rights Working Group on Minorities Ninth Session , 12-16 May
- Nwanaju, I.U. 2016. *Nostra Aetate* and the effect of Segregation on the attitude of children: a call for a dynamic re-evaluation of pedagogical policy in a pluralist society. *Journal of Education and Practice* Vol.7, No.10.
- Odimegwu, C. and Somefun, O.D. 2017. Ethnicity, gender and risky sexual behaviour among Nigeria youth: an alternative explanation. *Reproductive Health* (2017) 14:16
- Ogbogu, C.O. 2009. An Analysis of Female Research Productivity in Nigerian Universities, *Journal of Higher Education Policy and Management* Volume: 31 Issue: 1
- 2011. Gender Inequality In Academia: Evidences From Nigeria. *Contemporary Issues In Education Research – September 2011 Volume 4, Number 9*

- Ojiako, J.O. (1981) *Nigeria: Yesterday, Today And ...* Awka-Nigeria: Africana Educational Publishers (Nig) Ltd 44-45
- Olusanya, B; Alakija, OP; and Inem, VA. 2010. Non-Uptake of Facility-Based Maternity Services in an Inner-City Community In Lagos, Nigeria: An Observational Study. *J. Biosoc. Sci.*, (2010) **42**, 341–358
- Oluyemi, J.A.; Yinusa, M.A.; Raji A.; and Kadiri, K.K. 2014. Some Cultural and Language Issues in Sexually Transmitted Diseases Campaign in Nigeria. *Research on Humanities and Social Sciences* Vol.4, No.15, 2014.
- Oringanje, C.; Meremikwu, M.M.; Eko, H.; Esu, E; Meremikwu, A; Ehiri, J.E. 2016. Interventions for preventing unintended pregnancies among adolescents. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*, Issue 2
- Osaghae, E. E. (1998) *Nigeria Since Independence: Crippled Giant*. London: Hurt and Company. 63
- Otite, O.: (1990) *Ethnic Pluralism and Ethnicity in Nigeria*, Shaneson, Ibadan 35-36
 ----- (2000) *Ethnic Pluralism, Ethnicity and Ethnic Conflicts in Nigeria* 2nd Edition Shaneson, C.I. Limited, Ibadan
- Post K & M. Vickers (1973), *Structure and Conflict in Nigeria 1960-1966*, London: Heinemann
- Salaudeen, A.G.; Akande, T.M.; Musa, O.I.; Bamidele, J.O.; and Oluwole, F.A. 2010. Assessment of violence against women in Kano metropolis, Nigeria. *The Nigerian postgraduate medical journal* · September 2010.
- Saratu, Abdulwahid (2006), Gender Differences in Mobilization for Salaudeen, A.G.; Akande, T.M.; Musa, O.I.; Bamidele, J.O.; and Oluwole, F.A. 2010. Assessment of violence against women in Kano metropolis, Nigeria. *The Nigerian postgraduate medical journal* · September 2010.
- Tajudeen, OI. 2015. Legal framework for the protection of child rights in Nigeria. *AGORA International Journal of Juridical Sciences*, No. 3 (2015), pp. 46-52
- Toyo, E. (1999) 'Youth, Women, Workers and Minority Interests in Nigerian Constitution: Personal Reflections' Uya, O. E. & V. C. Uchendu (eds.) *Issues in the 1995 Nigerian Draft Constitution*
- Udoh, I.I.L. 1994 Initial Reading Programme for the Ibibio Adult Learner: Some Practical Considerations.
- Ugo, I. 2011. A study of selected issues of polygny and the extended Family system among traditional Igbo-speaking people of Imo state of Nigeria: Missiological implications as they relate to evangelism and church planting. UMI Dissertation Publishing.
- Unterhalter, E. 2012. Inequality, capabilities and poverty in four African countries: girls' voice, schooling, and strategies for institutional change, *Cambridge Journal of Education*, 42:3, 307-325

Appendix 1- Workshop programme

SOCIALLY INCLUSIVE CITIES

Research Workshop

Tuesday, 23rd May 11am – 3.15pm

Delta State University, Abraka, Faculty of the Social Sciences

Programme:

9.00 Pre –meeting Dr. Joyce Ogwo Ogwezi's office (all welcome)

9.30 set-up (*All*): SIGNS from downstairs to venue

Equipment: Flip chart, Pens, Large post- it notes, recorders, Video/photographs, Name tags, Registration list, H&S blurb, expenses forms

11:00 **Registration** – *led by Andrew; refreshments*

11.20 **Formal Welcome - The Dean**

(self) **introductions** - Dr. Joyce Ogwo Ogwezi

Housekeeping blurb.

Ask everyone to give name, organisation, 3 key words /phrases summarising your interest in the topic - participants to write on post-it note

Andrew to transfer post-its to wall mounted flip chart paper during world café

11.40 **Project overview** – Prof. B. S. C. Uzochukwu

11:50 **Global evidence review findings:**-Prof Ben

- Which ethnic and religious minorities experience inequalities in the Nigerian context and what impact does this have upon them?
- What are the key drivers of ethnic and religious exclusion and what concepts and theories are used to explain such exclusion?
- What research designs might help to improve social justice?
- What mechanisms/models of collaboration can be identified that support partnerships between different stakeholders?
- Which experts, other networks and large research projects are currently developing relevant knowledge in this area and could collaborate?
- What gaps in the current evidence need to be filled in order to inform future policy and practice?

12.20 **Q & A** for issues of clarification

Group photograph

13.15 **World Café** 20 minute discussions on key questions – Prof. Ben

Key messages to be captured on flip charts by facilitators along with recording of discussion. Facilitators will feedback the main points from the discussions at end – approx 2 mins each. Invite additional comments from participants

All flipcharts with key ideas to be stuck up on the wall

Table 1: Concepts – Chaired by Prof Onige Otite and facilitated by Dr. Joyce Ogbo Ogwezi

How does exclusion work – key drivers and mechanisms?

What are the most pressing research questions and challenges in this area?

Which populations should be particularly targeted for interventions?

What overlaps and differences exist between health, education, local government and police sectors?

Table 2: Methods- Chaired by Prof Chris Eghwudjakpor and facilitated by Prof. B. S. C. Uzochukwu

What are the most appropriate methods for research that aims to help reduce inequalities?

What are the key challenges for present and future research? How can these be overcome?

What overlaps and differences exist between health, education, local government and police sectors?

Table 3: Strategies- chaired by Prof. V.T Jike and facilitated by Prof. Ben

What is the potential for multi-sector collaboration to reduce exclusion from public services? Who are the key stakeholders?

What good practice can we learn from existing collaborative initiatives?

What overlaps and differences exist between health, education, local government and police sectors?

14:15 **Report back / wider discussion** (*led by Prof Uzochukwu, informed by note takers and self introductions from first session*)

14:45 **Summary and next steps. Actions from the day** Dr Joyce Ogbo Ogwezi:

- *Follow up workshop report to be circulated for comments. Ask for any actions that have been suggested from the day that can be taken back to service organisations*
- *Future workshop – invitation to present work on inclusion strategies (5th July – let Ghazala know if wish to present)*
- *permission to include people in the IC Network and circulate their details to other Network members (tell Andrew if they want to opt out)*
- *Evaluation forms*

15:15 Close

Appendix 2- List of workshop participants

SN	Title	Name	Surname	Sector (NGO, Academic, Policy, Public Service)	Name of Organisation	Job Title

1	Professor Emeritus	Onigu	OTITE	Academic		Retired
2	Professor	Benedict O.	EMUNEMU	Academic	Department of Educational Management University of Ibadan, Ibadan, Nigeria	Professor, Educational Management
3	Ms	Ruth E.	AGHANTE	NGO	Women Standard-Bearers International	Director, Youth Empowerment
4	Professor	Christian	EGHWRUDJAKPOR	Academic	Faculty of the Social Science, Delta State University Abraka	Dean/Professor of Sociology
5	Professor	V.T.	JIKE	Academic	Department of Sociology Delta State University Abraka	Professor of Sociology
6	Dame (Chief) Mrs	Florence	EHINLAIYE	Public Service/NGO/Community Leader	Ahweyae-Isoko Women Group	School Proprietor/Politician
7	Mrs	Fanty	WARIYAI	NGO/Women Leader	Gbaramatu Kingdom Development Association	Ijaw Women Leader
8	Dr	Benjamin Uwaeru	NWANNE	Academic	Department of Mass Communication, Delta State University Abraka	Reader
9	Dr	Patrick	IJEH	Academic	Department of Mass Communication, Delta State University, Abraka	Snr. Lecturer
10	Dr	Chinyere	OKEKE	Health	University of Nigeria teaching Hospital, Enugu	
11	Rt. Hon	Jumoke	AKINDELE	Policy	Ondo State House of Assembly, Akure	Hon. Speaker
12	Hon. Chief (Mrs)	Faith	MAJEMITE	Local Government	Ethiope-East Local Government Area	Chairperson
13	Dr.	Okiemute	MADJEMU	Health	DELSU Teaching Hospital	Med. Doctor
14	Hon. Mrs.	Izuegbu Benedicta	OSAKUNIH	Local Government	Ukwuani Local Government Area	Chairperson
15	Dr.	Vitalis C.	OTUAMA	Public Service/Health	Department of Anaesthetic and Intensive Care Unit, DELSU Teaching Hospital, Oghara	

16	ACP	Yomi	SHOGUNLE	Police	Police Headquarters, Abuja	Assistant Commissioner of Police
17	Brig. Gen. (Dr.)	Nurudeen A	HUSSAIN	Security & Health	Ministry of Defence Health Implementation Prog., Abuja	Director General
18	Rt. Hon. Dr.	Daniel C.	OGBUABOR, MBBS, MPH, MSc (HEMP), MPA	Policy	House Committee on Health, Enugu State House of Assembly, Enugu	Chairman
19	Dr.	Godwin	NWABUNKA	NGO	Grooming People for Better Livelihood Centre, Lagos	CEO
20	Air Commodore	Ayodele Daniel	DUDUSOLA	Security/Air Force	Nigerian Airforce Holding Company, Abuja	Air Commodore
21	Ms.	Temilola	GEORGE	Security/Research	National Defence College, Abuja	Research Fellow
22	Rev. Fr.	Mark	IKEKE	Religion	Catholic Church	Priest
23	Mrs	Gabari Gladys	OMARE	NGO	Ijaw Women Advocacy Group	Leader
24	Dr.	Harvey	IGBEN	Academic	Delta State University, Abraka	Snr. Lecturer
25	Mr.	Perekeme	TEBEKAEMI	Academic	DELSU	
26	Mrs.	Deborah Laju	EDAH	NGO	Coastal Women Forum, Warri	National President
27	Mr	Benedict Oghenero	OGBORU	Policy	NIMC DELTA	
28	Mrs	Queenett O	IRORI	Academic	DELSU	PG Student
29	Ms	Shola	IBUKUN	Academic	DELSU	PG Student
30	Mrs	Hannah	IVWIGHREN	Academic	DELSU	PG Student

Appendix 3- Databases searched

IDEAS RePEC
Google Advanced Search

Google Search
Pubmed
NCBI Resources
AJOL